Universal health coverage in Latin America 3

Social determinants of health, universal health coverage, and sustainable development: case studies from Latin American countries

Luiz Odorico Monteiro de Andrade, Alberto Pellegrini Filho, Orielle Solar, Félix Rigoli, Lígia Malagon de Salazar, Pastor Castell-Florit Serrate, Kelen Gomes Ribeiro, Theadora Swift Koller, Fernanda Natasha Bravo Cruz, Rifat Atun

Many intrinsically related determinants of health and disease exist, including social and economic status, education, employment, housing, and physical and environmental exposures. These factors interact to cumulatively affect health and disease burden of individuals and populations, and to establish health inequities and disparities across and within countries. Biomedical models of health care decrease adverse consequences of disease, but are not enough to effectively improve individual and population health and advance health equity. Social determinants of health are especially important in Latin American countries, which are characterised by adverse colonial legacies, tremendous social injustice, huge socioeconomic disparities, and wide health inequities. Poverty and inequality worsened substantially in the 1980s, 1990s, and early 2000s in these countries. Many Latin American countries have introduced public policies that integrate health, social, and economic actions, and have sought to develop health systems that incorporate multisectoral interventions when introducing universal health coverage to improve health and its upstream determinants. We present case studies from four Latin American countries to show the design and implementation of health programmes underpinned by intersectoral action and social participation that have reached national scale to effectively address social determinants of health, improve health outcomes, and reduce health inequities. Investment in managerial and political capacity, strong political and managerial commitment, and state programmes, not just time-limited government actions, have been crucial in underpinning the success of these policies.

Introduction

Health and disease are established by many factors including environmental exposures, housing, education, and social and economic status. Thus, improvement of population health and health equity needs intersectoral action and social participation, which have been introduced by many Latin American countries.

Health is an important dimension and a sensitive tracer of sustainable development. Health represents the collective effect of social, economic, and physical life conditions. A healthy population enables increased labour productivity and economic returns to households from labour market participation, which creates opportunity for more inclusive and sustainable growth.

The Declaration of Alma-Ata, the Commission on Social Determinants of Health, and the Rio Political Declaration on Social Determinants of Health have underlined the crucial importance of policies and actions on social determinants of health in the promotion of health equity. In 2012, the United Nations General Assembly Resolution “The future we want” affirmed that “Universal Health Coverage is a key instrument to enhancing health, social cohesion and sustainable human and economic development.” Universal health coverage contributes to the social, economic, and environmental dimensions of sustainable development, and its pursuit should not be restricted to health care, and should include promotion of population health.

Equity is inherent as a goal of universal health coverage because it implies universal access for all people to needed health services, of sufficient quality across the continuum of care without the risk of financial hardship as a result of using those services. Similarly, following

Key messages

- The broad context of health, including social determinants, democratic progress, and sustainable development, are intrinsically related. Because change in one domain affects others, integrated health, social, and economic actions are needed in the design of public policies and health systems to achieve equitable health and welfare.
- Latin American countries have substantial experience in intersectoral action of varying scope, intensity, and management approaches to improve population health outcomes. As well as time-limited government actions, investment in managerial and political capacity, strong political and managerial commitment, and state programmes have been crucial in underpinning success.
- Latin American countries have effectively used social participation with institutionalised deliberative mechanisms of participation (Brazil) and intersectoral action (Cuba), to enhance equity. However, achievements in population health and social outcomes expressed as country averages hide the unacceptably wide and persistent social and health inequities.
- The health challenges from chronic non-communicable diseases, violence, road traffic accidents, and illicit drug use can only be met in Latin America by simultaneous investments in health systems and actions to address social determinants of health. Hence, broad conception, design, and implementation of universal health coverage need to incorporate actions aimed at addressing social determinants of health if equitable health is to be achieved for present and future generations.
sustainable development, the universal health coverage notion has been enlarged to cover the continuum of care, including health promotion that addresses social determinants of health. Structural inequities, which define social hierarchy in countries, also establish different health needs, resources, and capabilities to navigate health systems. Health sector interventions alone are not enough to improve population health and social wellbeing. Policies and actions from economic, education, transport, housing, agriculture, and other sectors are needed to improve social determinants of health. Therefore, the health sector needs to act as a leader to catalyse intersectoral actions aimed at addressing disparities in social determinants of health, improving health, and reducing health inequities. Atun and others provide a detailed analysis of health systems and universal health coverage and Colear and others address the historical antecedents of health reforms.

Social and health inequities in Latin America
Latin American countries are characterised by their colonial legacies and high and persistent socioeconomic inequalities with among the highest Gini indices (a measure of income inequality in a country) in the world. Poverty and inequality worsened substantially in the 1980s and inequality increased until the late 1990s, when the average Gini index for Latin America reached more than 58. Between 1990 and 2004, income equality continued to deteriorate in many Latin America countries but improved in others (figure 1). In 2004, Latin America had the highest average income Gini index of 52·5, which was 8 points higher than Asia, 18 points higher than Eastern Europe and Central Asia, and 20 points higher than high-income countries. However, from 2005, with economic growth and social policies aimed at addressing poverty and socioeconomic disparities, income equality, as shown by Gini indices, started to improve (appendix).

Between 1980 and 2010, Latin American countries achieved improvements in human development indices relative to the levels of improvement attained worldwide (figure 1). However, especially between 2000 and 2010,
improvements in the Gender Inequality Index have been scarce, especially when compared with countries such as Norway and Sweden where inequities between women and men in relation to reproductive health, empowerment, and the labour market are the lowest in the world (figure 2).

Even in countries such as Brazil, which has achieved huge reductions in poverty and introduced universal health coverage, inequalities in access to health services and health outcomes driven by social determinants of health remain a major challenge. Wide differences exist between socioeconomic groups (measured by educational attainment) in access to antenatal services, infant mortality, under-5 mortality, diabetes mortality rate, and mortality rate from homicide (appendix).

Beginning in the 1990s, many Latin American countries introduced redistributive policies and social sector reforms to address the wide inequities and poor achievement in relation to human development. By the 2000s, these policies had started to exert a positive effect in addressing inequities. For example, between 2000 and 2010, income inequality, as measured by Gini index, narrowed in 12 of the 17 Latin American countries for which comparable trend data are available (figure 3). Similarly, labour income inequality and salary differentials among workers have decreased, partly because of government policies implemented in most Latin American countries to increase minimum wages, expand formal employment, and broaden opportunities for basic education and skilling. Additionally, conditional cash-transfer programmes have helped to improve income levels of poor families, stimulated school attendance for children, and increased demand for health promotion and prevention services. However, despite these improvements, in 2011, about four in ten workers did not have health insurance coverage or a pension, unlike workers in the formal sector who have insurance coverage.

Starting in 1990 and especially in 2000–10, health levels in Latin American countries improved more quickly than did improvements in income compared with other countries in the world, as shown by the relative improvements of income and health indices (figures 1 and 4).

However, although economic development and public policies that encourage equity have partly reduced social injustices, important social and health inequities persist in Latin American countries facing the growing challenges of non-communicable diseases, urbanisation, road traffic accidents, violent deaths, and increasing illicit drug use—problems rooted in social determinants of health. Rapid urbanisation means the urban population in Latin America is projected to grow from 394 million in 2000, to 609 million in 2030, potentially creating large unmet health needs in conurbations.

Since the early 1970s, researchers in Latin America have explored health and social inequities as a central topic of their empirical and theoretical inquiry to show the complex associations between society and health, and created an important body of knowledge to inform policies. These researchers established strong networks to debate social determinants of health and to promote actions to address them. They also created the social medicine movement, which spearheaded the fight for democracy during the military dictatorships, promoted health rights, and helped shape health system and social reforms in several Latin American countries.

Intersectoral action and social participation to address social determinants of health and achieve universal health care

Intersectorality is a political, administrative, and technical process that involves negotiation and distribution of power, resources, and capabilities (technical and institutional) between different sectors. Intersectoral action not only demands a societal vision or a political intention of the government, but also management capability, along with new institutional arrangements and training for managers in health and other sectors to develop appropriate technical capacity.

Intersectoral action, once regarded as an exceptional response to uncommon events such as epidemic outbreaks, is increasingly used to address emerging challenges related to chronic non-communicable diseases, violence, road traffic accidents, and illicit drug use. Increased evidence and realisation of the importance of social actions in addressing social determinants of health have prompted a transition from coordination of information to coordinated action to address emerging challenges. Increasingly, Latin American countries have faced the intersectoral action dilemma—a transition from an approach in which each sector works by itself, to
Social participation

The Commission on Social Determinants of Health identified participatory approaches as a crucial component of a health system to tackle health inequities underpinned by "...organisational arrangements and practices that involve population groups and civil society organisations, particularly those organisations working with socially disadvantaged and marginalised groups, in decisions and actions that identify, address and allocate resources to health needs".

In the context of universal health coverage reforms, social participation (especially of marginalised populations) is an important mechanism to gather evidence for the social determinants of health and the causes of inequities that establish access to services and effective coverage—eg, through community monitoring approaches. Social participation also provides the means to act on the social determinants of health and factors that affect access to health services through community mobilisation and appropriate strengthening of health systems.

Social participation has an intrinsic value, as a citizen's right to participate in decisions affecting them, and an important instrumental value, because the participation of communities and civil society groups in the development, implementation, and assessment of public policy is a necessary part of transparent and accountable governance in democracies. Social participation is essential for mobilisation of political support for policies aimed at addressing disparities in social determinants, combating health inequities, and for sustaining the changes introduced by redistribution of power and resources, as shown in Brazil where social participation is an integral part of health system governance.

A progressive spiral of intersectoral action, with coordination of information among different sectors and implementing activities at intersectoral programming with integrated problem identification policy design and implementation. The intensity of intersectorality ranges from information to cooperation in which the action focus is on intervention of diseases, to cooperation and coordination in which the focus is on prevention and health promotion, and to integration of policies and strategies to achieve health in all policies in which the focus is on interventions aimed at addressing social determinants of health. The extent to which a particular type of intersectoral approach contributes to reductions in social and health inequities remains a central question.

Intersectoral coordination and cabinet meetings on social determinants are now a regular feature of government activities in several countries such as Brazil and Chile, which have created ministries focusing on specific problems (eg, for social development, urban development, sex equality, and poverty reduction). New presidential initiatives exist too, such as those in Mexico, to address societal emergencies such as drugs and violence through intersectoral action. These new governance structures have challenged the traditional unisectoral organisation of the state, and need new approaches for the distribution of power and responsibilities, in particular the participation of local authorities and civil society organisations in partnerships, social mobilisation, and decision making. The new governance arrangements demand more flexible responses from central governments. As intersectoral action and social participation become embedded in new governance arrangements, the loss of autonomy and power of each actor is outweighed by the gains in effectiveness in tackling complex situations.

In our analysis of intersectoral actions in the case studies, we consider three domains: scope and target, organisation of intersectoral action, and results, especially in the extension of coverage and reduction of health inequities (panel 1).

For the source of data for figure 2 see https://data.undp.org/dataset/Table-4-Gender-Inequality-Index/pj34-nwq7

For the source of data for figure 3 see https://data.undp.org/dataset/Income-GiniCoefficient/36ku-rvrj

Figure 2: Gender Inequality Index

Gender Inequality Index is a composite measure showing inequality in achievements between women and men in three dimensions: reproductive health, empowerment, and the labour market. Data from United Nations Development Programme.

Figure 3: Decreasing income inequity in Latin America in selected countries, 2000–10

(appendix). The success of such policies relies on broad social mobilisation and wide recognition of the seriousness of health inequities and the urgent need to combat them.24,25

Social participation strengthens democracy because institutions and decision makers take into account citizens’ views on changing or maintaining the structure and values of a society in relation to a political system and its policies.26 For example, in Cuba and Venezuela, which have socialist regimes, social participation in the development of public policy is encouraged. In other Latin American countries, including many that fought hard to rid military dictatorships, political regimes based on a representative model of democracy are in force, creating a conducive environment to direct participation,26,27 as discussed in detail by Atun and colleagues’ and Cotlear and colleagues.27

Factors that impede social participation are a combination of short-term pragmatism; the dominance of a bureaucratic and technocratic notion of public policies, an underestimation of community knowledge and capabilities, and resistance to the sharing of power.28 To transcend these obstacles to social participation, there is a need for close relationships between governments and populations in the policy-making process, institutionalisation of mechanisms for participation, training of public actors and communities, strengthening of community organisations, design of coherent communication strategies, dissemination of information, and increased research efforts to understand and promote participatory processes. In conclusion, participation needs to be put into practice because a prerequisite to strengthening participation is the experience of participation itself.

Most Latin American countries have established institutional mechanisms (similar to public ombudsmen, usually called defensorías del pueblo in Spanish or ouvidorias in Portuguese) to hear and address citizens’ demands for publicly provided health services. Additionally, Latin American countries have experience of social participation for public sector issues or specifically for health based on communitarian associative structures, such as municipal health councils, at the municipal level. These participative structures extend beyond sex, race and ethnic groups and include social movements and civil society organisations. Other experiences include patient associations that typically operate at the national level as political actors in regular dialogue with governments.

**Intersectoral programmes to address social determinants of health in Latin American countries**

We explore intersectoral programmes implemented in Brazil, Chile, Colombia, and Cuba across the three domains of analysis. These programmes, although diverse in terms of target populations, activities, and coverage, share the common objective of reduction of health inequities through intersectoral actions on social determinants of health. In addition to the contributions to health-system goals of improved level and distribution of health, financial protection and user satisfaction, these programmes also contribute to sustainable development goals advanced simultaneously by other sectors.

**Brazil: Bolsa Família**

The conditional cash transfer programme Bolsa Família (family grant) was established in 2003 to ensure access to social rights for health care to provider social rights for health care, thereby expanding access to health and education for families in poverty and extreme poverty, and to reduce poverty and income inequities. The programme unified several existing programmes (School Grant, Food Grant, Food Card, and Gas Grant) and in 2011 became part of the broader government strategy Plan Brasil Sem Miséria (Plan Brazil without Misery) to raise population income and welfare.

The Plan Brazil without Misery targets Brazilian households with per person incomes of less than R$70 (about US$30). The programme has three axes: productive inclusion (actions that create employment and income generation opportunities for poor citizens in rural and urban areas, including access to means of production, technical assistance to improve production capacity, and access to markets for food); second, access to public services (in education, health, welfare and food security);
and third, income transfers, which includes provision of Continued Provision Benefit, and the Bolsa Familia programme (appendix).

The Bolsa Familia programme in Brazil is widely regarded as a success. It has lifted millions of people out of poverty, supported people with the greatest unmet need to access health services and has contributed to progressive realisation of universal health coverage.29,30 As well as extending the net of social and financial protection, Bolsa Familia has also contributed to improvements in health indicators for the beneficiary population. Between 2002 and 2011, the percentage of pregnant women (in the target population) attending seven or more antenatal consultations increased from 49·1% to 61·8%.31 Intersectoral action through Bolsa Familia has also contributed to improvements in health and action on social determinants. Integration of health and education policies in Bolsa Familia expanded access for the poorest groups in Brazil and in 2003–13, contributed to substantial increases in immunisation and reduced child malnutrition, and in 2004–09 to reductions in under-5 mortality.32,33

**Chile: Chile Crece Contigo**

*Chile Crece Contigo* (Chile Grows with You) is a system of protection for early childhood development, with a mission to monitor, protect, and uphold the rights of all children and their families by providing programmes and services, which enable special support for the poorest households that account for most vulnerable families34 (appendix). The system, which started in 2006 during the government of President Michele Bachelet’s (the first woman President of Chile) is continuing. The evidence so far suggests positive effects in reducing child poverty and increasing access to educational opportunities and health.35

*Chile Crece Contigo* contributes to progressive realisation of universal health coverage by providing a universal platform to support early child development for all preschool children younger than 5 years and for all pregnant women, and includes proportional measures to the greater needs of the more vulnerable populations. This combination of universal and targeted support to households with children, with links to other social programmes for the more disadvantaged populations, is designed to reinforce actions aimed at attainment of universal health coverage indicators, enhanced health outcome, and improved social determinants of health (eg, in relation to education, employment) related to sustainable development goals.

**Colombia: De Cero a Siempre**

*De Cero a Siempre* (From birth to Forever) is the National Strategy for Comprehensive Care in Early Childhood in Colombia. Launched by the Presidency of Colombia in early 2011, the strategy aims to unify the efforts of the public and private sectors, civil society organisations, and international cooperation to improve the experience and outcomes of early childhood in Colombia (appendix).36

The strategy36 builds on an earlier programme, *Hogares Comunitarios de Bienestar Social*, a community nursery programme that provided nutrition and child care for children from poor households. Among beneficiaries, the programme led to improvements in children’s nutritional status and employment of women.37 It offers important insights on intersectoral action in working towards universal health coverage. Of particular relevance is the role of the education sector, which has the coordination lead for the strategy, and yet the strategy is a platform to enhance coverage and quality of health care. Likewise, the strategy focuses on strengthening primary health care, including through participatory and social mobilisation approaches, with the local authorities playing an important part in supporting progress towards universal health coverage and wider sustainable development objectives.

The aim of the strategy, which combines both universal and targeted interventions, is to ensure rights to

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Institutional development</strong></th>
<th><strong>Methods or technologies</strong></th>
<th><strong>Training of human resources</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intersectorality for action on social determinants of health to promote sustainable development</td>
<td>Creation or strengthening instances for intersectoral coordination</td>
<td>Development of methodologies for intersectoral planning and coordination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social participation</strong></td>
<td>Creation or strengthening local committees with the participation of government and civil society</td>
<td>Development of methods to disseminate information to members of committees to support their decision making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthening the role of health sector for universal health coverage and action on social determinants of health</td>
<td>Creation or strengthening of instances in Ministry of Health for health promotion and action on social determinants of health</td>
<td>Development of methodologies of health planning and programming with social determinants of health approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring trends on health inequities for policy making</td>
<td>Creation or strengthening the monitoring inequities and assessment of interventions to support policy making</td>
<td>Creation or strengthening of information systems for monitoring health inequities, development and dissemination of methods for assessment of interventions on social determinants of health</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table: Capacity building for universal health coverage and action on social determinants of health
comprehensive care for 2.9 million vulnerable children in the poorest populations while prioritising populations in extreme poverty, through national coordination of education, culture, planning, health, and social protection sectors at national and local levels. The strategy also aims to achieve 100% coverage of the population aged up to and including 5 years, roughly 4 million children.38–42

**Cuba: Dengue Prevention Programme and Eradication of Aedes aegypti**

Cuba’s Dengue Prevention Programme and Eradication of *Aedes aegypti* is a comprehensive set of intersectoral interventions aimed at elimination and control of *Aedes aegypti* mosquito (and other vectors) through environmental sanitation, hygiene, and collective household actions38 (appendix).

Underpinned by legislation, the programme includes the local government, the Ministry of Public Health, community associations, family doctors, water resources management, the anti-mosquito brigade, and several civil society organisations. The programme has led to a reduction of dengue infections and improved environmental management for vector control.38–42

The Dengue Prevention Programme’s grounding at the primary health-care level, with implementation leadership provided by provincial and municipal governments and participatory approaches to create local level needs assessment and action plans, offers important lessons for intersectoral action for universal health coverage, and sustainable development. Additionally, as with the other case studies, the experience of Cuba highlights the importance of investment in health promotion and disease prevention as integral components of universal health coverage.

**Intersectoral action and social participation to address social determinants of health and advance towards universal health coverage: lessons learned from Latin America**

The experiences from the four Latin American countries highlight the challenges faced when addressing health inequities and social determinants of health. These challenges are not only rooted in inherent societal inequities, but also in the institutional organisation of government sectors that encourage unisectoral action and hinder multisectorality.

The country cases and the policies we look at provide an insight into the ways in which integrated intersectoral actions are developed and implemented. The four country case studies show how approaches to universal health coverage and social determinants of health, underpinned by intersectorality and social participation, can be used in a range of situations. For example, communicable disease control (Cuba), improving experience and outcomes of early childhood development (Chile and Colombia), and conditional cash transfers aimed at ensuring rights to health and education and poverty alleviation (Brazil). However, the country cases also show that although meaningful cooperation and coordination between different sectors exists, in practice, real integration of policies and programming with joint design, programming, implementation, and assessment is challenging.

In the four countries studied, integrated intersectoral policies and actions aimed at addressing social determinants of health and reforms for progressive realisation of universal health coverage have been hindered by institutional and managerial constraints, such as rigid budgets department specific performance targets, and limited capacity to implement complex projects and change. To overcome these constraints, capabilities should be developed in four areas: intersectorality, social participation, enhanced role of health sector, and monitoring of health inequities (table). These capabilities need to be underpinned by institutional development, establishment of managerial methods, and mechanisms and training of human resources.

The paucity of systematically collected robust data and well designed assessments in relation to the programmes studied in the case studies also suggest the need to strengthen health information systems to provide disaggregated data by socioeconomic groups for monitoring health inequities and to study the effect of interventions on target populations.

**Panel 2: Achieving intersectoral action to address social determinants of health and universal health coverage**

- Combine demand-side (eg, cash transfers or financial support) and supply-side interventions (services)
- Engage local level leadership for intersectoral action and develop sustainable learning and capacity building to address social determinants of health
- Enhance investment in cost-effective promotion and prevention measures through primary health care that address social determinants of health towards progressive realisation of universal health coverage
- Support community participation, in particular of more disadvantaged populations and through formal mechanisms, in efforts towards universal health coverage and sustainable development
- Use disaggregated data and community-level monitoring to gather information about health and social inequities, in combination with systematic monitoring, assessment, and provision of relevant information to users and policy makers to inform policy, planning, resource allocation, and practice
- Combine targeted measures for the more disadvantaged populations with universal approaches to improve coverage, so that reforms aimed at advancing universal health coverage and sustainable development are equity-oriented in nature, but also ensure all population groups benefit from progress
- Integrate planning, budgeting, implementation, and monitoring activities between sectors in support of universal health coverage and sustainable development, with the health sector playing both the part of a leader and a partner in the initiatives of other sectors
- Create conducive legal and policy environments across sectors for action on key social determinants of health, universal health coverage, and sustainable development

www.thelancet.com  Vol 385  April 4, 2015  1349
The experiences from the four Latin American countries provide lessons and insights to other countries on the importance of intersectorality and social participation to simultaneously address social determinants of health when developing policies for universal health coverage and sustainable development (panel 2).

The next decade should provide the opportunity to show how a new generation of social policies, emphasising social determinants and universal health coverage, can create a better mix of priorities and investments in Latin American countries. The expanded definition of social rights (including the right to health) in the past two decades means that social policies without a path to universal health coverage will not be acceptable. However, persistent social inequities, changing epidemiological profile, and citizens’ demands for rights will need to be addressed, if universal health coverage is to be achieved and sustained in Latin American countries. As Latin American societies prosper, live longer, and become more equal, citizens’ demand for improved access to quality health care will increase. A question that remains is how these positive democratic and economic trends will be harnessed for sustainable and equitable development.

There is a window of opportunity for Latin American countries to actively share globally their unique experiences in intersectoral action and social participation to address social determinants of health and achieve universal health coverage, but also to learn from countries that have succeeded in addressing social determinants to grow with more social justice and do less harm for future populations. Latin American countries can learn better ways to coordinate actions between social, biological, and environmental determinants of health, and build health systems with greater emphasis on primary health care to show how governments can orient their actions to improve health, welfare and prosperity for all, and not just a select few.

Declaration of interests

TSK and FR are responsible for the views expressed in this article and they do not necessarily represent the views, decisions, or policies of the institution with which they are affiliated. We declare no competing interests.

References


30 Shei A. Brazil’s conditional cash transfer program associated with declines in infant mortality rates. Health Aff (Millwood) 2013; 32: 1274–81.


